

The Roman Catholic Bishop of Cubao

41 Lantana Street, Cubao, Quezon City, Philippines 1111 Tel. Nos. 723-5113 to 5118 / Fax No. 723-7847 www.dioceseoscubao.ph

TO: THE PARISH PRIESTS, PAROCHIAL VICARS, RELIGIOUS,

DEACONS AND LITURGICAL MINISTERS

RE: THE UNIVERSAL LAW ON THE POSTURE OF KNEELING AT MASS

DATE: 16 APRIL 2018

The Love and Peace of the Risen Lord!

The gestures and bodily posture of both the Priest, the Deacon, and the ministers, and also of the people, must be conducive to making the entire celebration resplendent with beauty and noble simplicity, to making clear the true and full meaning of its different parts, and to fostering the participation of all (GIRM, 42).

It is my desire that the Diocese of Cubao adhere to the norms and guidelines of the Church, more importantly to the aim of the Church of fostering **unity in worship**, in the celebration of the Liturgy. It is therefore imperative that the authority of the bishop manifest the same objective. **To remain as a welcoming Church and to act as one body of Christ**, avoiding confusion, may I remind all to follow the norms as prescribed by the Constitution on Sacred Liturgy, by the General Instruction and by the Code of Canon Law.

Kneeling is almost a universal gesture of reverence, homage, honor and worship. Scripture presents to us how ancient the gesture is as a sign of respect, obedience, submission, prayer and supplication. Psalm 95 has it as an invitation to reverence the Lord. "Come, let us worship and bow down, Let us kneel before the LORD our Maker." Thus, the gesture must be observed properly in the Liturgy as the nature of its particular parts demand, and as fitting in the celebration of worship. All gestures therefore must conform to what the Church pronounces.

Please be guided by the provisions of the Church:

The General Instruction on the Roman Missal:

- 1. **The Universal Law** The General Instruction on the Roman Missal #43 establishes the practice of kneeling for the Consecration as the universal norm of the Roman Rite. This is understood to mean from the *Epiclesis* to the *Mysterium Fidei*.
- 2. **American Particular Law** The Bishops of the United States adapted the universal norm with *Roman approval*, retaining the *custom* of kneeling from after the Sanctus to the Doxology. The U.S. version of the General Instruction no. 43 hence reads:

"In the dioceses of the United States of America, they should kneel beginning after the singing or recitation of the Sanctus until after the Amen of the Eucharistic Prayer, except when prevented on occasion by reasons of health, lack of space, the large number of people present, or some other good reason. Those who do not kneel ought to make a profound bow when the priest genuflects after the consecration."

Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy, Second Vatican Council:

- 22. 1. Regulation of the sacred liturgy depends solely on the authority of the Church, that is, on the Apostolic See and, as laws may determine, on the bishop.
- 2. In virtue of power conceded by the law, the regulation of the liturgy within certain defined limits belongs also to various kinds of competent territorial bodies of bishops legitimately established.
- 3. Therefore no other person, even if he be a priest, may add, remove, or change anything in the liturgy on his own authority.

1983 Code of Canon Law:

Can. 5

- §1. Universal or particular customs presently in force which are contrary to the prescripts of these canons and are reprobated by the canons of this Code are absolutely suppressed and are not permitted to revive in the future. Other contrary customs are also considered suppressed unless the Code expressly provides otherwise or unless they are centenary or immemorial customs which can be tolerated if, in the judgment of the ordinary, they cannot be removed due to the circumstances of places and persons.
- §2. Universal or particular customs beyond the law (praeter ius) which are in force until now are preserved.
- Can. 23 A custom introduced by a community of the faithful has the force of law only if it has been approved by the legislator, in accordance with the following canons.

Can. 24

- §1. No custom which is contrary to divine law can acquire the force of law.
- §2. A custom which is contrary to or apart from canon law, cannot acquire the force of law unless it is reasonable; a custom which is expressly reprobated in the law is not reasonable.
- Can. 25 No custom acquires the force of law unless it has been observed, with the intention of introducing a law, by a community capable at least of receiving a law.

Can. 837

§1. Liturgical actions are not private actions but celebrations of the Church itself, which is "the sacrament of unity," namely, a holy people assembled and ordered under the bishops; therefore liturgical actions pertain to the whole body of the Church and manifest and

affect it, but they affect the individual members of the Church in different ways according to the diversity of orders, functions and actual participation.

§2. Liturgical actions, to the extent that by their proper nature they involve a common celebration, are to be celebrated where possible with the presence and active participation of the Christian faithful.

Can. 838

- §1. The supervision of the sacred liturgy depends solely on the authority of the Church which resides in the Apostolic See and, in accord with the law, the diocesan bishop.
- §2. It is for the Apostolic See to order the sacred liturgy of the entire Church (universa ecclesia), to publish the liturgical books, to review their translations into the vernacular languages and to see that liturgical ordinances are faithfully observed everywhere.
- §3. It pertains to the conferences of bishops to prepare translations of the liturgical books into the vernacular languages, with the appropriate adaptations within the limits defined in the liturgical books themselves, and to publish them with the prior review by the Holy See.
- §4. It pertains to the diocesan bishop in the church entrusted to him, within the limits of his competence, to issue liturgical norms by which all are bound.

The General Instruction, the Constitution on Sacred Liturgy and the Code of Canon guide us to adhere to the call for a unified posture of the faithful. For the common posture of the people, in part, manifests the outward sign of being the Mystical Body of Christ. Moreover, this unity among the members of the Body of Christ is also manifested by the unity of rite with the Local Ordinary. In the Diocese of Cubao, we hereby exhort all to follow the Universal Norm of kneeling after the Sanctus, during the Consecration, and stand after the Consecration, with the Mysterium Fidei. With this, we pray for a clear manifestation of our being Catholic, especially in the Diocese of Cubao. Attached herewith is the Catechesis "To Stand in Your Presence and Serve You" provided by the Diocesan Ministry for Liturgical Affairs.

Please ensure that catechesis on this directive be done among the faithful within your Parish.

Thank you for your kind attention and consideration. The Lord bless, guide and keep you!

Very sincerely yours in the good Lord,

+HONESTO F. ONGTIOCO, D.D.

+ Honer D. Certin

Bishop of Cubao

TO STAND IN YOUR PRESENCE AND SERVE YOU

Catechesis on Standing after the Consecration to the Doxology of the Eucharistic Prayer

Introduction

Postures and gestures are important in the liturgy because they show the meaning of what we are doing and signify our unity as the One Body of Christ (GIRM 42). They serve as a special way of expressing our belief and our worship through our bodies. When we stand together at the Gospel reading, we venerate the Lord who speaks to us as the Good News is read. When we kneel at the Consecration, we adore him together in the Holy Eucharist. Thus, to understand these postures and gestures and do them correctly is one vital way of leading us to the "full, active and conscious participation" (SC 14) envisioned at Vatican II.

In this short catechesis, we shall learn about the posture of standing at the anamnesis after the Consecration until the doxology of the Eucharistic Prayer. Our hope is to shed light on this matter by looking at what the rubrics say, clarifying its historical background, tracing the practice of the Church from the time of the early Christians, and understanding the rich theology behind this posture of standing during the great priestly prayer of praise and thanksgiving.

1. Why do some stand and some kneel at this point in the liturgy?

Before the reform of the Council, there was only one rubric concerning the people's participation, which told them to kneel throughout a Low Mass except for the reading of the Gospel. Saint John XXIII began to institute reforms in 1960 with a new set of rubrics for High Mass. Here we find the consecration included among the times for kneeling but not the entire Canon. However, for penitential and requiem masses, kneeling was prescribed "from the completion of the Sanctus up to the preface of the Pater Noster, exclusively."

Meanwhile, the lone rubric for Low Mass was suppressed, which opened the way for different applications when it comes to adapting the postures for High Mass. It is from hereon that we will find missals that ask the people to stand after the Consecration as well as other missals that will only ask them to stand after the Great Amen, even outside of penitential and requiem masses.

¹ Frederick R. McManus, *Handbook for the New Rubrics*, (London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1961), 190. We find exactly the same indications in an even earlier commentary: Joseph Jungmann, SJ, *The Mass of the Roman Rite: Its Origins and Development* (New York: Benzinger Brothers, Inc., 1961), 172-173. The version we consulted is the 1961 centennial edition but the first edition of Jungmann's book, more popularly known as *Missarum Solemnia*, first came out in 1951.

After the conciliar reform of the liturgy, these variations would still persist as some episcopal conferences like that of the United States obtained permission to continue their previous practice as local adaptations or exemptions from the general rule.

What do the rubrics tell us to do?

All three editions of the General Instructions of the Roman Missal (GIRM) indicate standing as the posture to be observed at this moment in the liturgy (see 1969 IGMR 21, 1975 GIRM 21, and 2002 GIRM 43). As decreed by Blessed Pope Paul VI, this came into force and became binding for the entire Roman Rite of the Catholic Church on November 30, 1969. Thus, regardless of whether they were standing or kneeling in this part of the liturgy prior to this date, all are now required to stand by virtue of the promulgated 1969 IGMR, except in places where subsequently approved local adaptations would allow otherwise.

Were there approved local adaptations in the Philippines?

A survey conducted by the Episcopal Commission on Liturgy in 1984 showed that 25 out of the 32 ecclesiastical territories were still kneeling instead of standing at this point in the liturgy, a practice preferred by 23 out of 31 bishops who were surveyed then.² In line with this, the Philippine Bishops, in their January 1970 Meeting, had earlier proposed as a local adaptation that "the people kneel during the Eucharistic Prayer, from immediately after the Sanctus until the beginning of the doxology..."³ However, this proposed adaptation never received the confirmation from Rome required by the Constitution on the Liturgy before any such adaptation can be introduced (SC 40).

We also find similar proposals in the 1990 Guidelines for the Eucharist and the 2002 Philippine Adaptations to the General Instructions of the Roman Missal. Number 3 of the 1990 Guidelines states that "The people should kneel from the Sanctus until the end of the Eucharistic Prayer.... If the acclamation after the consecration is sung, the people may stand for it and keep standing." Meanwhile, the 2002 Philippine Adaptations includes the proposal that: "In the Philippines, the people kneel after the Sanctus, rise for the memorial acclamation,

² See Florencio I. Testera, O.P., "Local Legislation on the Holy Eucharist" in Boletin Edminstico de Filipinas Vol. LXIII, Nos. 692-693, 440.

³ Ibid. See also Camilo J. Marivoet, C.I.C.M., "Decisions of the Bishops' Conference and Confirmations by Rome' in Litergical Information Bulletin of the Philippines, Vol. XII, No. 6, 144 and Florencio L. Testera, O.P., Canon Law Digest of the Philippine Catholic Ownch (Marila: Faculty of Canon Law of the University of Santo Tomas, 1987), 47 and (Manila: Faculty of Canon Law of the University of Santo Tomas, 1995), 108.

and kneel after the Lamb of God."4 Nevertheless, like their 1970 predecessor, these proposals did not also obtain the needed recognitio from Rome.

Meanwhile, by the end of the 1990s, practically all dioceses and parishes in the country have been correctly following the GIRM. As such, the permission given by the 2002 GIRM which said that "Where it is the practice for the people to remain kneeling after the Sanctus until the end of the Eucharistic Prayer and before Communion when the Priest says Ecce Agnus Dei, it is laudable for this practice to be retained"⁵ did not apply to us, although we find it in the version of the GIRM included in the 2011 Philippine Edition of the Roman Missal.⁶

4. What has been the practice of the early Church?

"In the gospels, whenever a posture is indicated for the meals of Jesus, it is always the posture of reclining" and so it was in the Last Supper. However, with the passage of time, standing became the normative posture in the liturgy where the participants came to be referred to as the circumstantes or circumadstantes, those who stand around the table of the Lord. We find the earliest testimony concerning this in the Apostolic Tradition of Hippolytus (ca. 215), which has become the basis for what is now our Eucharistic Prayer II:

Remembering therefore your death and your resurrection, we offer you the bread and the wine, we thank you for having judged us worthy to stand before you and serve you.9

We also read about it in the famous second-century account (ca. 250) of Saint Justin the martyr where he narrates how the early Christians celebrated the Sunday Eucharist. We find references to it as well as in the Eastern Anaphora of

⁴ See Archbishop Socrates B. Villegas, D.D., Pastoral Letter On the Question of Kneeling or Standing After the Consecration Until After the Great Amen During the Eucharistic Celebration, 19 March 2016. http://www.chepnews.com/chepnews/7p=74706 (accessed August 3, 2016). The 1990 Guidelines is printed in full in the 1995 edition of Testera's Canon Late Digest.

^{5 2002} GIRM 43. Emphasis ours.

⁶ As an aside, what the 2002 GIRM effectively did for us was to legitimize our practice of kneeling before Communion after the singing of the Agnus Dei.

⁷ Leonard and Mitchell, The Postures of the Assembly During the Eucharistic Prayer (Chicago: Liturgy Training Publications, 1994), 48. See Mt 9:10, 26:7, 26:20; Mk 2:15; Lk 7:36, 11:37, 14:15, 22:14.

⁸ We find a trace of this, for example, in the lone Pre-Vatican II rubric for the participation of the people that we mentioned earlier, which instructs the people to kneel but calls them circumstantes.

Deiss, Springtime of the Liturgy: Liturgical Texts of the First Four Conturies, 131. Emphasis ours. The title of this catechesis is taken from here: Asture cover te et tibl ministrure, "to stand in your presence and serve you."

Addai and Mari (ca. 3rd or 5th CE), 10 and in the "Clementine Mass" attributed to Clement of Rome, which is preserved in the Apostolic Constitutions (ca.380). 11 One of the most beautiful examples is in the Alexandrian Anaphora of Saint Basil where the deacon invites the congregation to rise towards the end of the Preface, precisely at the mention of the heavenly beings who stand in the presence of God (cui adstant Angeli et Archangeli...), as if to invite them to assume the same bodily posture and join with the celestial hosts for the singing of the Sanctus. 12

Fittingly, this ancient practice was restored by the liturgical reform following the Council, which, like that of Saint Pius V in 1950, sought to restore the Eucharistic celebration "to the pristine norm and rite of the holy Fathers." ¹³Indeed, all four of our major Eucharistic Prayers today contain some reference to the standing posture of the assembly, at least in the original Latin. In the Commemoratio Pro Vivis of the Roman Canon, the assembly is called circumstantes. ¹⁴ As mentioned earlier, Eucharistic Prayer II has the beautiful phrase from Hippolytus "astare coram te et tibi ministrare." ¹⁵ Meanwhile, Eucharistic Prayer III petitions God to hear the prayers of the family he has willed to stand before him ("Votis huius familiae, quam tibi astare voluisti, adesto propitius"). ¹⁶ Lastly, as in the Roman Canon, the newly composed Eucharistic Prayer IV also uses the term circumstantes.

What does the standing posture signify?

Aside from being the practice of the early Christians, standing during the Eucharistic Prayer was a posture rich in meaning for them. Lucien Deiss comments on the text of Saint Justin:

In the early Church the normal posture for prayer was standing. This was more than an attitude of respect for God, more than a simple inheritance

^{10 &}quot;And we too, Lord/ your weak, frail, and lowly servants/ who have gathered and are standing before you at this moment..." Deiss, Springtime of the Liturge: Liturgical Texts of the First Four Centuries, 162. Emphasis ours.

^{11 &}quot;We give you thanks through him/ for having judged as worthy to stand before you and exercise the priesthood for you..." Delss, Springtime of the Liturge: Liturgical Texts of the First Four Centuries, 234. Emphasis ours.

¹² See Cipriano Vaggagini, The Canon of the Mass and Liturgical Reform (London: Geoffrey Chapman, 1967), 51.

^{13 &}quot;ad pristinam sanctorum Patrum normam ac ritum..." See Plus V, Quo Primum, 14 July 1570. See also SC 50 as well as Paul VI, Missale Romanum. DOL 1361.

¹⁴ The Roman Missal, English Translation According to the Third Typical Edition (Collegeville, MI: Liturgical Press, 2011) 636.

¹⁵ The Roman Missal, 648. We find a critique of this ICEL2010 translation in Edward Foley, ed. A Commentary on the Order of Mass of the Roman Missal (Quezon City, Claretian Publications, 2012), 332. Among the things that are lamented is the loss of a literal translation of "astare," which was previously the case in ICEL2006 and ICEL1975. Our present Aklat ng Pagminist as Roma also carries a literal translation: "kami'y nagpapasalamat dahil kami'y iyong minarapat na tumayo sa harap mo para maglingkod sa iyo..."

¹⁶ The Roman Missal, 779.

from the Jewish tradition. It was, before all else, an expression of the holy freedom the Lord had given his followers by his resurrection. It was also a sign of expectation of the Lord's coming (see Lk 21: 36); this expectation was especially keen on Sunday, the day that was a kind of expectation of the eternal Day of God.¹⁷

Then Cardinal Ratzinger similarly wrote that standing is the primary Easter form of prayer, "in which we show forth the Paschal victory of the Lord, even in the posture of our prayer." He then recalled how Canon 20 of the Council of Nicaea prohibited kneeling in the liturgy on Sundays and throughout the Easter season, a strong testament to the Christian association of standing with honoring and proclaiming the Resurrection. The future Pope also pointed out the eschatological significance of standing: "standing prayer is an anticipation of the future, of the glory that is to come... Insofar as liturgical prayer is an anticipation of what has been promised, standing is its proper posture."

Aside from its Paschal and eschatological significance, liturgical experts also highlight the priestly character of the standing posture. Chupungco writes: "In a sense every liturgical posture is a theological declaration. Kneeling and genuflection are postures that express adoration and reverence, sitting denotes openness to teaching, and standing symbolizes priestly prayer." We find this confirmed in the New Testament, for instance in the book of Hebrews which states that "every priest stands day after day at his service..." We also see this in the Old Testament, on which the lines of the ancient anaphora of Hippolytus were probably based: "For the Lord your God has chosen [Levi] out of all your tribes to stand and minister in the name of the Lord..."

Furthermore, Jungmann sees in the assembly's posture of standing around the altar ("circum adstantes") their full and unqualified participation in the offering of the sacrifice. He notes that the original text of the Roman Canon "ascribes to the faithful the offering of the sacrifice without any special restriction

¹⁷ Deiss, Springtime of the Liturgy: Liturgical Texts of the First Four Centuries, 93. See footnote 11.

¹⁸ Joseph Cardinal Ratzinger. The Spirit of the Liturgy. trans. John Saward (San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 2000). 194-195.

¹⁹ We still find a trace of this in the rubric in the Rites of Ordination which omits kneeling for the Litany of the Saints on Sundays and during the Easter season. See Communical of Biology, 507, 529, 556, 580.

²⁰ Ibid., p. 196. Ratzinger rightly adds that "However, insofar as liturgical prayer belongs to that "between" time in which we live, then kneeting remains indispensable to it as an expression of the "now" of our life." Although he identified standing as the posture proper to liturgy, he maintains that kneeling also plays an essential part in it.

²¹ Anscar J. Chupungco, OSB. What Then Is Liturgy? (Quezon City: Claretian Publications, 2010), 183.

²² Heb 10: 11-14.

²³ Deut 18:5. See also verse 7.

'who offer to Thee this sacrifice of praise' (quae tibi offerunt hoc sacrificium laudis). They are not idle spectators, even less a profane crowd; rather they are all together sharers in that sacred action in which we stand before Thee, O God."24

6. What about reverence for the Holy Eucharist?

In the liturgy, standing is also a gesture of reverence. For instance, we all stand at another high point of the celebration, which is the reading of the Gospel. There is also no question here of undermining the importance of kneeling since this posture has its place in the Eucharistic prayer during the Consecration and again at the reception of Holy Communion. As Baldovin says, "The question rather has to do with whether kneeling is appropriate at the eucharistic prayer." 25

Aside from its rich theological significance, standing during the Eucharistic prayer has an added practical value of drawing our attention into the celebration instead of becoming absorbed in our prayers of adoration or petition, to which kneeling is conducive. Saint Cyprian of Carthage, commenting on the introductory dialogue of the Eucharistic Prayer, explains the lovely phrase Sursum corda: "When we rise to pray, we must be careful to give our attention whole-heartedly to the prayers we say. Every thought of the world or worldly things must retire into the background so that the soul may contemplate nothing but the content of the prayer." As a seasoned pastor, Cyprian knew very well how our minds tend to drift away during the Eucharistic prayer in which the predominant role of the presider can easily eclipse the role of the participants. Our hearts then sink into ourselves and our own concerns instead of joining in the prayer of the Church. Standing helps us to avoid this danger.

7. What if I prefer to kneel as a matter of personal conviction?

Uniformity in the actions of the liturgical assembly has always been a pastoral concern of the liturgical reform from the 1969 IGMR all the way to the 2002 GIRM.²⁷ Aside from fostering their active participation, this uniformity serves as "a sign of the community and the unity of the assembly"²⁸ in contrast

²⁴ Jungmann, The Mass of the Roman Rite: Its Origins and Development, 399-400. It was not until much later that the words would be prefixed with pro-quibus tibi offerinus tel which will sometimes come to be equated with those who paid the stipend for the Mass to be offered.

²⁵ Leonard and Mitchell, The Postures of the Assembly During the Eucharistic Prayer, 10.

²⁶ Quoted in Sternbeck. The Order of Mass According to the Extraordinary Form of the Roman Rite: The Missal of Blessed John XXIII., 35.

^{27 1969} IGMR, 21. See also 1975 GIRM 21. DOL 1411 and 2002 GIRM 42.

^{28 1969} ICMR, 21. This point is reiterated in number 62 which states that: "They should become one body, whether by hearing the word of God, or joining in prayers and song, or above all by offering the sacrifice together and

with the former notion of "hearing Mass" with a tendency to individualistic piety on the part of those present. This is why as much as possible all the members of the assembly follow the same posture and gesture, except in very rare cases such as being physically unable to do so because of ill-health. Any appearance of individualism or division is to be shunned in order to show and strengthen this unity by joining and conforming with the community's actions and postures.²⁹

It has to be clear that the question here is not of legitimacy but propriety. In essence, there is nothing wrong with kneeling at this or at any point to adore the Lord in the Blessed Sacrament. Making acts of private devotion and worship are good in themselves. However, the liturgy is not the ideal setting or context to indulge such private devotions which must never compete with it, since the liturgy itself is the "source and summit" (cf. SC 10) of the Christian life and must always take precedence over such "forms of prayer alternative to, or substitutive of, the liturgical action itself." In line with this, pastors need to ensure that "the faithful should be made conscious of the preeminence of the Liturgy over any other possible form of legitimate Christian prayer."

For instance, the practice popular before the reform of praying the rosary and other devotional prayers while the Eucharist was being celebrated is now to be discouraged. This does not mean however that they are to be discontinued altogether but are only to be taken outside the setting of the Eucharistic liturgy. Similarly, Eucharistic adoration has its proper place in the Mass, particularly at the Consecration and during Communion. However, those who wish to prolong their adoration may do so at another time outside of the Mass. These other forms of prayer are in themselves praiseworthy but are highly personal in nature and tend to isolate us from the celebration and the rest of the people of God gathered around the Lord's table. As Chupungco reflects:

Liturgical spirituality requires that we pay full attention to the meaning of the words we recite and the ritual actions we perform. Someone inquired whether it was a form of distraction to gaze on the crucifix with full concentration during the Eucharistic prayer such that the prayer serves as a kind of backdrop to meditation. Liturgical spirituality means that are consciously engaged in the celebration and are able to relish its spiritual wealth and beauty.³²

sharing together in the Lord's table. There is a beautiful expression of this unity when the faithful maintain uniformity (communiter servatis) in their actions and in standing, sitting or kneeling,

²⁹ See the 1969 IGMR 62. See also 1975 GIRM 62. DOL 1452.

³⁰ Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments, Directory on Popular Piety and the Liturgy, 11.

³¹ fbid

³² Chupungoo. What Then Is Liturgy?, 255.

Conclusion

From the rubrical aspect, standing has been the established practice in the Roman Rite since 1969 and has since remained in force for us in the Philippines. From the side of history and theology, this has been the ancient and constant practice of the Church and to make an authentic return to "established practice" is to remain standing at this point in the Mass and rediscover its rich significance. Finally, from a pastoral perspective, this standing posture better contributes to active participation and fosters the unity of the liturgical assembly.

As such, retaining the status quo of standing after the Consecration to the Doxology of the Eucharistic Prayer better corresponds to what the rubrics say, to the tradition of the Church, and to what the liturgy signifies theologically and demands pastorally, so this is what we shall maintain and observe here in the Archdiocese of Manila.